

# **Marriage, Divorce, and the Abandoned Wife in Jewish Law**

**A CONCEPTUAL UNDERSTANDING OF  
THE AGUNAH PROBLEMS IN AMERICA**

*by*  
*Michael J. Broyde*

**KTAV Publishing House, Inc.**  
**2001**

## *Contents*

<b>Foreword</b>	
<b>The Purpose of This Book</b>	<b>xi</b>
<b>Preface</b>	
<b>A Restatement of the Agunah Problem</b>	<b>xv</b>
<b>Chapter One</b>	
<b>Jewish Marriage: A Conceptual Review of Marriages in the Jewish Tradition</b>	<b>1</b>
The Fault Exception	3
Historical Agunah Problems and Solutions	3
The Talmudic Agunah Problem	3
The Levirate Marriage Problem and the Case of Agunah	5
Summary	7
The Modern Agunah Problem	7
Solved Cases	7
The American Agunah Problem	8
Proposed Solutions to the American Agunah Problem	10
Annulments	11
Conditional Marriages	12
Conditional Promises to Give a <i>Get</i>	12
State Intervention in the Jewish Divorce Process	12
Support Agreements	13
<b>Chapter Two</b>	
<b>Paradigms for Marriage as Grounds for Divorce in the Jewish Law Tradition: An Historical Review</b>	<b>15</b>
The Image of Divorce in the Torah	17
The Rabbinic Period	17

Post-Talmudic Jewish Law I: The Geonim	19
Post-Talmudic Jewish Law II	20
Option I: Unilateral No-Fault Divorce	20
Option II: Mutual Consent or Hard Fault	21
Option III: Return to Contractual Rules	22
Option IV: Marital Abode as the Norm	23
Gender Equality as the Issue?	23
Modern Developments and Summary	25
 Chart 2.1:	
Views of Marriage, Divorce, and <i>Igun</i> in the Era of the <i>Rishonim</i>	28
 <b>Chapter Three</b>	
<b>Dual System and Divorce: The Impact on the Agunah</b>	
<b>Problem of the American Legal System</b>	29
Introduction	29
The Dual System and the Problem of the Agunah	30
Two Legal Systems	32
A Comparison of Private and Public Law Models	33
The New York Experience	35
Creating the Right to Be Divorced	36
One Solution: Ignore the Dual System Problem	37
A Critique of This Approach	38
The Issue of Commercial Custom	38
Another Solution: Follow Secular Law	39
Summary of the Dual System Problems	40
 <b>Chapter Four</b>	
<b>The Role of Bet Din: How Does a Jewish</b>	
<b>Court Prevent Abandonment of Spouses?</b>	43
Introduction: Theory and History	43
The Modern Reality	43
Jewish Law and Its Role in Marriage	45
Modern Jewish Law and Marriage in America	46
Modern Jewish Law and Marriage in Israel	49
Comparison of Modern Jewish Law and	
Marriage in Israel and America	52
The Bet Din Issue in America	54
The Relationship Between the Bet Din System	
and the Secular System	55
Conclusion	57

## **Chapter Five**

### **The Multitextured Agunah Problem**

<b>and Proposed Modern Solutions: A Conceptual Critique</b>	<b>59</b>
Unilateral No-Fault Divorce as the Solution	60
Abandoning Marriage as a Solution	63
Contractarian Solutions and Their Problems	63
Rabbinical Tribunals as a Solution	65
Prenuptial Agreements as Marriage Contracts	66
Secular Intervention as a Model for Divorce	68
Summary of the Modern Solutions and Their Problems	70

#### **Chart 5.1:**

<b>Views of Marriage, Divorce, and Igun in the Modern Era</b>	<b>71</b>
---	-----------

## **Chapter Six**

### **Summary: A Conceptualization of the Agunah Problem**

The Nature of the Agunah Problem	73
Preconditions to Successful Solutions	75

## **Chapter Seven**

### **Summary: A Conceptualization of Solutions to the Agunah Problem**

The Nature of the Solutions	79
Pluralistic Images of Marriage and Divorce	81
Multiple Types of Prenuptial Agreements: A Real Solution to the Root Problem of Multiple Images of Divorce	82
The Bet Din System	82

## **Chapter Eight**

<b>Conclusion: What Can Be Done?</b>	<b>85</b>
--------------------------------------	-----------

## **Appendix A**

<b>A Brief Historical Introduction to Jewish Law</b>	<b>87</b>
--	-----------

## **Appendix B**

### **Error in the Creation of Jewish Marriages:**

<b>Under What Circumstances Can Error Void         the Marriage Without Requiring a <i>Get</i></b>	<b>89</b>
Preface	89
Introduction	91

Marriage as Contract	92
Defects in the Man	97
Continuing Marriages Which Started with a Defect	100
Conclusion	102
 <b>Appendix C</b>	
<b>The 1992 New York <i>Get</i> Law: A Less than Ideal Solution that Creates Halachic Problems</b>	<b>103</b>
Introduction	103
Halachic Considerations	105
The Reality of Divorce	113
Conclusion	115
 <b>Appendix D</b>	
<b>Brief History of Secular Marriage and Divorce Law</b>	<b>119</b>
 <b>Appendix E</b>	
<b>Civil Death as a Concept in Public Marriage Jurisdictions Including American Law and Islamic Law</b>	<b>125</b>
 <b>Appendix F</b>	
<b>Sample Arbitration and Prenuptial Agreements</b>	<b>127</b>
Memorandum of Agreement	128
Model A	128
Model B	129
Model C	129
Model D	129
Model E	130
Additional Paragraph Governing Fault	130
Model F: The Prenuptial Agreement Authorized by the Orthodox Caucus	132
 <b>Notes</b>	 <b>137</b>
<b>Table of References</b>	<b>187</b>
<b>Subject Index</b>	<b>193</b>
<b>About the Author</b>	<b>197</b>