

From Theodulf to Rashi and Beyond

Commentaria

SACRED TEXTS AND THEIR COMMENTARIES:
JEWISH, CHRISTIAN AND ISLAMIC

Founding Editors

Grover A. Zinn
Michael A. Signer (ob.)

Editors

Frans van Liere
Lesley Smith
E. Ann Matter
Thomas E. Burman
Robert A. Harris
Walid Saleh
Celia Chazelle

VOLUME 14

The titles published in this series are listed at *brill.com/comm*

From Theodulf to Rashi and Beyond

*Texts, Techniques, and Transfer in Western European
Exegesis (800–1100)*

Edited by

Johannes Heil
Sumi Shimahara



BRILL

LEIDEN | BOSTON

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

Names: Heil, Johannes, editor. | Shimahara, Sumi, editor.

Title: From Theodulf to Rashi and beyond : texts, techniques, and transfer in western European exegesis (800 - 1100) / edited by Johannes Heil, Sumi Shimahara.

Description: Leiden ; Boston : Brill, 2022. | Series: Commentaria, 1874-8236 ; volume 14 | Includes bibliographical references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2022014362 (print) | LCCN 2022014363 (ebook) | ISBN 9789004514690 (hardback) | ISBN 9789004515833 (ebook)

Subjects: LCSH: Bible--Criticism, interpretation, etc.--History--Middle Ages, 600-1500. | Christianity and other religions--Judaism. | Judaism--Relations--Christianity.

Classification: LCC BS500 .F76 2022 (print) | LCC BS500 (ebook) | DDC 220.609--dc23/eng/20220622

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2022014362>

LC ebook record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2022014363>

Typeface for the Latin, Greek, and Cyrillic scripts: "Brill". See and download: brill.com/brill-typeface.

ISSN 1874-8236

ISBN 978-90-04-51469-0 (hardback)

ISBN 978-90-04-51583-3 (e-book)

Copyright 2022 by Koninklijke Brill nv, Leiden, The Netherlands.

Koninklijke Brill nv incorporates the imprints Brill, Brill Nijhoff, Brill Hotei, Brill Schöningh, Brill Fink, Brill mentis, Vandenhoeck & Ruprecht, Böhlau and V&R unipress.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, translated, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without prior written permission from the publisher. Requests for re-use and/or translations must be addressed to Koninklijke Brill nv via brill.com or copyright.com.

This book is printed on acid-free paper and produced in a sustainable manner.

In memoriam Bat-Sheva Albert



Contents

Acknowledgments XI

Notes on Contributors XIII

Introduction: The Study of the Bible in the Middle Ages from Theodulf
to Rashi 1

*Johannes Heil and Sumi Shimahara,
in cooperation with Hanna Liss*

1 “Hebraica Veritas”: The History of a Christian Idea 21

Frans van Liere

2 Julian of Toledo’s (642–690) “De Comprobatione Sextae Aetatis”:
An Original Use of Biblical Exegesis in Late Visigothic Spain? 43

Bat-Sheva Albert

3 Bede, the Old Testament, and Easter 63

Celia Chazelle

4 Functions and Sources of Vernacular Glosses in Hebrew-French Biblical
Glossaries 100

Marc Kiwitt

5 “Hebraica and Gallica Veritas”: The Function of the Hebrew-French
Glossaries in 12th Century Jewish and Christian Exegesis 119

Hanna Liss

6 Scribes as Active Readers: Manuscript Development and
Jewish-Christian Polemic in Rashi and in the “Glossa Ordinaria” 147

Devorah Schoenfeld

7 Finding Needles in Haystacks: Rabbinic Exegesis in Carolingian Bible
Commentaries 163

Burton Van Name Edwards

8 “Latin Midrashim”, or: How to Treat Historically-Contradictory
Evidence 183

Johannes Heil

- 9 Savoirs juifs et exégèse chrétienne à l'époque carolingienne: le cas du
ms. Barcelona, Catedral 64 et de son commentaire anonyme sur les
Chroniques 214
 Sumi Shimahara

- 10 How to Turn Jews into Pagans and Heretics: Notes on the
'Hermeneutical Jew' in Haimo of Auxerre's Biblical Exegesis 237
 Alfonso Hernández Rodríguez

- 11 From the "Rivers of Babylon" to the Rhine: The Itinerary of a Biblical
Motif 259
 Gianfranco Miletto

- 12 Prophétie et histoire dans l'exégèse latine sur Ezéchiel, IX^e–XII^e
siècle 271
 Guy Lobrichon

- 13 Hebrew Idiom and Figurative Reading between Theodulf of Orléans and
the Victorines: An Unstable Textuality 294
 Christopher Ocker

- 14 Karaite Attitudes towards the Biblical Text in the Eleventh and Twelfth
Centuries in Byzantium 347
 Luba R. Charlap

- 15 The Limits of Literalism in Medieval Karaite Translations of the Hebrew
Bible into Arabic 368
 Marzena Zawadowska

- 16 Rashi's Commentary on the Book of Ruth Updated, or: The Revision of
Interpretations from Manuscript to Manuscript 392
 Ingeborg Lederer-Brüchner

- 17 Beyond *Peshat* and *Derash*: The Linguistic Dimension of Rashi's
Commentary on Deuteronomy 414
 Jonathan Kearney

- 18 Corrections and Additions to Rashi's Commentary on Amos by Rashi
and His Students 427
 Jordan S. Penkower

- 19 Nebuchadnezzar and Charlemagne: Exile in Ninth-Century Carolingian
Exegesis 463
Steven A. Stofferahn
- Index of Manuscripts 485
- Index of Biblical and Rabbinical Literature, Apocrypha 488
- Index of Persons, Places, Subjects 494

Acknowledgments

The editors Johannes Heil and Sumi Shimahara would like to express their thanks first of all to the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft (DFG) and to the Alfried Krupp von Bohlen und Halbach-Foundation, Essen, for making this conference and its outcome—though after many years—possible. We are especially grateful to Frans van Liere, who gave his strong support to bring this volume into Brill's *Commentaria* series, to the reviewers whose commentaries were of great help to improve our approach, to Marcella Mulder at Brill who patiently supported us to bring this volume to shape, and to Noralyne Maranus at TAT Zetwerk who guaranteed an excellent typesetting process. The editors are also grateful to Kerstin Grotelüschen, Jonas Leipziger, Amélie Sagasser, Hanna Strehlau, and especially Daniel Rost (Heidelberg) for their support for the editorial work.

While the book was under preparation, Bat-Sheva Albert, one of the participants of the Heidelberg conference and contributors to this volume passed away. With best and lasting memories for Bat-Sheva, colleague and friend, we are grateful to her daughter, Michal Bergman, for writing a eulogy which mirrors the abysses, consolations and achievements of our generations.

Professor Bat-Sheva Albert (1942–2021) was a historian and lectured in the Department of General History, Bar-Ilan University, Israel, for almost four decades. Her studies were dealing with Early Medieval Western Europe, the church and culture in the Carolingian period. Her first book was “The Case of Baruch. The Earliest Report of the Trial of a Jew by the Inquisition, 1320” (1974). Her Ph.D. (1977) examined Isidore's of Seville attitude towards Judaism and his impact on Early Medieval canon law through his work: “De fide Catholica contra Judaeos” (7th c. C.E.). Her latest research examined the Carolingian period—the anti-Jewish attitude by ecclesiastical scholars and the pilgrimage in a book named “Le pèlerinage à l'époque carolingienne” (Louvain-la-Neuve, 1999).

Bat-Sheva Albert was born in a small village in the Pyrenees Mountains in 1942: As a Jewish newborn she had very little chance to survive, but thanks to the courage of her mother and aunts, and good people who were lights in the darkness, they made it and survived after all. Her father was captured and died in Majdanek. She was three months old when he was gone forever. She decided to live in Israel when she was only 18 years old, and for her it was her only homeland. She returned home.

Her last two years were years of struggle. She continued her research almost till her death. After two painful years she has passed away and left us, her family, both with pain and good memories.

May her soul rest in peace—נשמתה צרורה בצרור החיים

Notes on Contributors

Bat-Sheva Albert

has studied under Avrom Saltman, who was renowned for his work on Carolingian biblical Exegesis. She has written many articles on Visigothic Spain, its culture, legislation and liturgy. Professor Albert was granted a research grant by France in order to assist her research on Carolingian Pilgrimage and her book on this topic was published by *La Revue d'Histoire Ecclesiastique*. She is also the author of the chapter on “Christians and Jews” in *The Cambridge History of Christianity*, Vol. III (Cambridge University Press, 2008). She has been invited to deliver papers in many conferences, and has written many reviews for *La Revue d'Histoire Ecclesiastique*, *Speculum* and *La Revue des Etudes Juives*.

Luba Rachel Charlap

Ph.D. (1995), Bar-Ilan University, is a Professor of Jewish studies and Hebrew language at Lifshitz College in Jerusalem, now in a position of Head of The Centre of Textual Studies. Charlap's main areas of interest are: the consolidation of the Hebrew grammar in the Middle Ages (Rabbanite and Karaite schools), philological biblical interpretation, Hebrew style and norm, and the acquisition of additional language. From her recent publications see: *Language and Textuality in Byzantine Karaism—Grammatical Concepts, Biblical Text Traditions, and Hermeneutic Aspects, in the Constantinople Center (Late 11th–First Half of 14th Centuries)* (AKM series, 116; Harrassowitz Verlag, 2019); “Lexical Root vs. Substantive Root—The Status of the Hebrew Alphabet as a Precursory System for Menaḥem ben Saruq's Root Concept”, *Journal of Semitic Studies* 65,2 (2020), 419–434.

Celia Chazelle

Ph.D. (1985), Yale University, is Professor of History at The College of New Jersey. She is the author of *The Crucified God in the Carolingian Era: Theology and Art of Christ's Passion* (Cambridge University Press, 2001), *The Codex Amiatinus and its “Sister” Bibles: Scripture, Liturgy, and Art in the Milieu of the Venerable Bede* (Commentaria, Brill, 2019), and numerous articles and essays on aspects of late antique and early medieval religion and art. She has also edited or co-edited five collections of essays on topics in medieval studies, among them the co-edited volume, *Why the Middle Ages Matter: Medieval Light on Modern Injustice* (Routledge, 2012). She is currently working on a new monograph provisionally titled, *Gregory the Great and the Construction of English “Whiteness”*.

Alfonso Hernández Rodríguez

completed his doctoral thesis “Anthropologie et ecclésiologie dans l'exégèse biblique carolingienne selon le *Commentaire sur le prophète Osée* d'Haymon d'Auxerre” under the supervision of Dominique Iogna-Prat. He has dedicated his academic career to the study of Carolingian biblical exegesis. He has published works in different academic journals such as *Revue d'Histoire de l'Église de France*, *Studi Medievali* and *Studia Monastica*, among others.

Johannes Heil

Ph.D. (1994), Goethe University Frankfurt, Habilitation for Medieval History at the TU Berlin (2003). He has been Friedrich Solmsen Fellow, Institute for Research in the Humanities UW Madison and at the Erasmus-Institute, Notre Dame. Since 2005, he holds the Ignatz Bubis Memorial Chair at the Center for Jewish Studies Heidelberg where he served from 2008–2019 as rector. He has written *Kompilation oder Konstruktion? Die Juden in den Pauluskommentaren des 9. Jahrhunderts* (Forschungen zur Geschichte der Juden, A 6; Verlag Hahnsche Buchhandlung Hannover, 1998), *Gottesfeinde—Menschenfeinde. Die Vorstellung von jüdischer Weltverschwörung (13.–16. Jh.)* (Antisemitismus: Geschichte und Strukturen, 3; Klartext Verlag 2006), and edited, among others, together with Janus Gudian et al. *Erinnerungswege—Kolloquium für Johannes Fried* (Frankfurter Historische Abhandlungen, 49; Franz Steiner Verlag, 2018).

Jonathan Kearney

Ph.D. in Near Eastern Languages (2006), University College Dublin, is a Lecturer in the Study of Religion in Dublin City University. Among his publications are *Rashi: Linguist Despite Himself* (LHBOT, 532; T & T Clark, 2010) and (ed. with Bradford A. Anderson) *Ireland and the Reception of the Bible: Social and Cultural Perspectives* (Scriptural Traces: Critical Perspectives on the Reception and Influence of the Bible, T & T Clark, 2018).

Marc Kivitt

Dr. Phil. (2010), Heidelberg University, is a Policy Officer at the European Commission, where he deals with Roma equality and inclusion. He has worked on Old French texts in Hebrew script, publishing partial editions of the medical treatise Fevres (Königshausen & Neumann, 2001) and the Hebrew-French glossary B.N. hébr. 301 (Universitätsverlag Winter, 2012).

Ingeborg Lederer-Brüchner

Ph.D. (2014), Center for Jewish Studies Heidelberg, graduated in Jewish Studies as well as in Library and Information Science. She studied in Heidelberg,

Jerusalem and Berlin, accomplished internships in New York City, Munich and Copenhagen. At the Center for Jewish Studies Heidelberg, she was Scientific Assistant at the Department of Bible and Jewish Bible Exegesis. Then, at the Judaica Department of the University Library Frankfurt/Main, she completed her librarian practical professional training in 2016 ("Bibliotheksreferendariat"). Her doctoral thesis about Josef Kara's commentaries on the book of Ruth was published in 2017 entitled *Kommentare zum Buch Rut von Josef Kara* (Hebrew editions, German translations and contextualizing interpretations). Since 2018, she is mother, planning and undertaking projects. Her research focus is the Hebrew Bible, Biblical Studies and Exegesis.

Hanna Liss

Ph.D. (1995), Free University Berlin, is Professor and Chair of the Department of Bible and Jewish Exegesis at the Center for Jewish Studies Heidelberg, Germany. She has published various monographs and articles on Medieval Jewish Exegesis and Jewish Bible Studies, including *Jüdische Bibelauslegung* (Mohr Siebeck, 2019); *Creating Fictional Worlds: Peshat Exegesis and Narrativity in Rashbam's Commentary on the Torah* (Brill, 2011).

Frans van Liere

Ph.D. (1995), Groningen University, is currently Professor of History and Director of the Medieval Studies Minor at Calvin University. He studied theology and medieval studies at the University of Groningen, taught religion and history at the College of Charleston, and is a member at the Institute for Advanced Study in Princeton. His area of research is medieval intellectual history, the history of the Bible in the Middle Ages, and the abbey of Saint Victor in the twelfth century. His publications include *An Introduction to the Medieval Bible* (Cambridge University Press, 2014), several editions and translations of the work of Andrew of Saint Victor for the *Corpus Christianorum* series (Brepols), and (together with Franklin Harkins) *Victorine Texts in Translation* (Brepols), vols 3, 6, and (together with Juliet Mousseau), vol. 9.

Guy Lobrichon

Ph.D. (1979) EHESS, Paris, was a lecturer at the Collège de France, then professor at the University of Avignon (now emeritus). Amongst many publications, he has written *La Bible au Moyen Âge* (Picard, 2003), and collaborated on *The New Cambridge History of Christianity. Early medieval Christianity, c. 600–c. 1100* (Cambridge University Press, 2008), *The New Cambridge History of the Bible. From 600 to 1450* (Cambridge University Press, 2012), and *Cultures of Eschatology. Vol. 1: Empires and Scriptural Authorities in Medieval Christian, Muslim, and Buddhist Communities* (De Gruyter, 2020).

Gianfranco Miletto

Ph.D. (1991), University of Turin, is university private lecturer (“Privatdozent”) at the University of Halle-Wittenberg. He has published on Biblical Philology and on the Jewish culture in Italy at the time of the Renaissance and Counter-Reformation: *L'Antico Testamento Ebraico nella tradizione babilonese: i frammenti della Genizah*, (Silvio Zamorani Editore, 1992); *Die Heldenschilde des Abraham ben David Portaleone*, 2 vols. (Peter Lang Verlag, 2003); *Glauben und Wissen im Zeitalter der Reformation: Der salomonische Tempel bei Abraham ben David Portaleone (1542–1612)* (De Gruyter, 2004). Currently he works in Heidelberg at the “Abraham Berliner Center” of the “Hochschule für Jüdische Studien” for a research on the Biblical manuscripts with Babylonian vocalization.

Christopher Ocker

Ph.D. (1991), Princeton Theological Seminary, is Professor and Director of Medieval and Early Modern Studies in the Institute for Religion and Critical Inquiry of the Australian Catholic University in Melbourne, Australia. His publications include *Biblical Poetics before Humanism and Reformation* (Cambridge 2002), *Church Robbers and Reformers in Germany, 1525–1547* (Brill, 2006), *Luther, Conflict, and Christendom: Reformation Europe and Christianity in the West* (Cambridge University Press, 2018), and numerous articles on religious conflict, biblical interpretation, and theology in the medieval and early modern periods. He is also Editor of Brill’s *Studies in Medieval and Reformation Traditions*, a co-editor of *Arbeiten zur Kirchengeschichte* (De Gruyter), and a co-editor of the *Journal of the Bible and Its Reception* (De Gruyter).

Jordan S. Penkower

Ph.D. (1983), Hebrew University, is Professor of Bible at Bar-Ilan University. He has published several books and numerous articles in the fields of (1) the transmission of the Hebrew Bible and the Masorah in the manuscripts and the printed editions; (2) the Bible in Rabbinic Interpretation (the Talmudim and the Midrashim); (3) Jewish Medieval Biblical Exegesis in the Middle Ages, especially the Commentary of Rashi. Among his publications, see: *Masorah and Text Criticism in the Early Modern Mediterranean—Moses Ibn Zabara and Menahem de Lonzano* (Magnes Press, 2014).

Devorah Schoenfeld

Ph.D. (2007), Graduate Theological Union, is Associate Professor of Judaism at Loyola University Chicago. She has published on medieval Bible commentaries, comparative theology and Jewish-Christian relations, including *Isaac*

on Jewish and Christian Altars: Polemic and Exegesis in Rashi and the Glossa Ordinaria (Fordham University Press, 2012).

Sumi, Shimahara

Ph.D. (2006), Université Paris Sorbonne, is Maître de conférences (Medieval History) at the Sorbonne Université—Faculté des Lettres. She had published a monograph, books and many articles on Carolingian culture, including *Haymon d'Auxerre, exégète carolingien* (Brepols, 2013) or *Imago libri. Les représentations carolingiennes du livre*, ed. with Charlotte Denoël and Anne-Orange Poilpré (Brepols, coll. Bibliologia, 2018).

Steven A. Stofferahn

Ph.D. (2003), Purdue University, is Professor and Chair of the Department of History at Indiana State University in Terre Haute, Indiana (USA). Specializing in intellectual and political culture, he has authored numerous articles in *Early Medieval Europe*, *Réflexions Historiques*, *Enarratio*, *The Historian*, *Magistra*, *The History Teacher*, and other journals, and has co-edited *Discovery and Distinction in the Early Middle Ages: Studies in Honor of John J. Contreni* (Medieval Institute Publications, 2013). His current research focuses on monastic missionary endeavors on the American Great Plains.

Burton Van Name Edwards

Ph.D. in History (1990), University of Pennsylvania. His dissertation was titled: *The Two Commentaries on Genesis attributed to Remigius of Auxerre: with a Critical Edition of Stegmüller 7195*. After teaching for almost 30 years, most recently at Bridgewater State University and Bryant University, Dr. Edwards retired in December, 2019. He continues to do research, especially creating critical editions and translations of 9th-century Bible commentaries. Dr. Edwards is best known for coediting with Celia Chazelle, *The Study of the Bible in the Carolingian Era* (Brepols, 2003). His most important publication is: *Remigii Autisiodorensis Expositio In Genesim*. Corpus Christianorum. Continuatio Mediaevalis, 136 (Brepols, 1999).

Marzena Zawadowska

Ph.D. in Oriental Studies (2008), Warsaw University (in cooperation with Tel Aviv University), is Assistant Professor in the Mordechai Anielewicz Center for the Study and Teaching of the History and Culture of Jews in Poland (Faculty of History, University of Warsaw) and Curator of Manuscripts in the Emanuel Ringelblum Jewish Historical Institute. She has chiefly published on medieval Karaite Bible exegesis, but her research interests also include history of Jewish

thought and literature. Her authored book, *The Arabic Translation and Commentary of Yefet ben 'Eli the Karaite on the Abraham Narratives (Genesis 11:10–25:18)*, appeared in Brill within the series “Karaite Texts and Studies” (Brill, 2012).